

## MINUTES

**Barnstable Historical Commission  
Town Hall  
367 Main Street, Hyannis  
Town Hall Hearing Room  
February 16, 2016**

Laurie Young, Chair	Present
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	Present
Nancy Clark	Present
Nancy Shoemaker	Present
George Jessop	Present
Ted Wurzburg	Present
Paul Arnold, Alternate	Absent
Jo Anne Miller Buntich	Director, GMD
Marylou Fair	Admin Assistant, GMD

Laurie Young called the meeting to order at 4:00pm

*Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:*

**Gardner, Amy, 886 Main Street, Cotuit, Map 035, Parcel 087**

Built c.1860-1870, Inventoried, Contributing Building in Cotuit National Register Historic District  
Partial Demolition

Represented by Peter Pometti, Architectural Innovations

**A motion was duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that the Historical Commission finds and determines that, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 886 Main Street, Cotuit that:**

- **The property is outside a local historic district;**
- **The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District and is individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places;**
- **The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;**

**The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.**

**Discussion:**

Nancy Shoemaker stated that she does not believe that the proposed demolition would meet the threshold to send to the Cape Cod Commission. George Jessop concurred and noted that the demolition is limited to a portion of the building that is not a historic section, perhaps even a later addition.

**VOTE:**

**AYE: None**

**NAY: Young, Clark, Fifield, Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg**

Peter Pometti explained the project would replace a one-story addition with a two-story addition to meet the height of the existing house, and this new addition would mimic the front foyer addition. Laurie Young confirmed that most of the changes are only visible from the rear elevation, and Nancy Shoemaker felt it would be an improvement and liked the hip roof element. Nancy Clark asked if the plans indicate enlarging a window, and Peter Pometti confirmed that a bay window would replace a bow window on the first level.

**Motion duly made by Nancy Clark, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed 886 Main Street, Cotuit, that the proposed demolition of parts of the Significant Building would be detrimental to the historical, cultural, or architectural heritage or resources of the Town. The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds that the parts of the Significant Building to be retained are Preferably Preserved and shall not be demolished.**

**AYE: None**

**NAY: So Voted Unanimously**

**Motion duly made by Nancy Clark, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 886 Main Street, Cotuit, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural or architectural heritage or resources of the Town.**

**AYE: So Voted Unanimously**

**Garthwaite, Wendy, 11 Maywood Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 130**

Built 1921, Not Inventoried, Contributing Building in Hyannisport National Register Historic District

Partial Demolition

Represented by Tate Isenstadt & Daniel Reynolds, TDI Building & Remodeling

**A motion was duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that the Historical Commission finds and determines after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 11 Maywood Avenue, Hyannis, that:**

- **The property is outside a local historic district;**
- **The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District and is individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places;**
- **The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;**

**The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.**

**Discussion:**

Historical Commissioners asked the representatives to detail the project, and Mr. Isenstadt explained that they propose to replace the roof above the sunroom that faces the water with a flat roof and new balcony, and replacing a window with a door.

**VOTE:**

**AYE: None**

**NAY: Young, Clark, Fifield, Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg**

**Motion duly made by Nancy Clark, seconded by George Jessop, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed 11 Maywood Avenue, Hyannis, that the removal of parts of the Significant Building would be detrimental to the historical, cultural, or architectural heritage or resources of the Town. The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds that the parts of the Significant Building to be retained are Preferably Preserved and shall not be demolished.**

**AYE: None**

**NAY: So Voted Unanimously**

George Jessop noted that the only change appears to be a balcony access over the existing sunroom and the removal of a window which will be replaced with a French door, and he felt this would not detract from the building, and materials and style were appropriate. Nancy Clark noticed that the window style on the upper floor has multiple panes, while the new French door proposed has no panes. Mr. Daniels agreed that the new door should replicate the windows and the 10-light door on the first floor. Nancy Clark felt that a single divide would be fine, as long as there is a divide, while George Jessop preferred a triple divide. All agreed that a paned glass door similar to the windows would be appropriate.

**Motion duly made by Nancy Clark, seconded by George Jessop, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 11 Maywood Avenue, Hyannis, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural or architectural heritage or resources of the Town. Modification to the proposed plan includes a paned glass door to the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor balcony comparable to the existing windows.**

**AYE: So Voted Unanimously**

**Grenier, Mark, 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 081**

Built c.1880, Inventoried, Contributing Building Hyannis Port National Register Historic District

Partial Demolition

Represented by Mark Grenier

**A motion was duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Nancy Clark, that the Historical Commission finds and determines, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, that:**

- **The property is outside a local historic district;**
- **The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District and is individually eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places;**
- **The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;**

**The BHC further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.**

**Discussion:**

Chair Young reminded the members that, at the January Public Hearing, the Commission referred the applicant to the Cape Cod Commission. Subsequently, Mr. Grenier worked with Sarah Korjeff to revise his plans to retain certain character-defining features. She confirmed that the Historical Commission had received the revised plans along with a copy of Ms. Korjeff's additional Memorandum. Nancy Clark asked the applicant to detail the revisions, and Mr. Grenier said he met with Cape Cod Commission staff and revised his plans to make the appropriate changes they advised: removing the cross gables from the west and east elevations, while retaining the shape of the porch and leaving it open; retaining the turret proposed for the second floor above the porch; expanding the footprint on the north elevation approximately 6 feet; scaling down the west elevation, cleaning up the dormer and adding a door for access to that side of the yard. He added that the chimneys have been added over time, and he proposed removing the rear chimney and rebuilding the existing chimney on the front. He said he also cleaned up the windows and kept their existing locations on the front and most of the sides, with changes on the other elevations. He said the vinyl siding would be removed, and he also plans to re-roof.

**VOTE:**

**AYE: None**

**NAY: Young, Clark, Fifield, Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg**

**Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Nancy Clark, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, that the removal of parts of the Significant Building would be detrimental to the historical, cultural, or architectural heritage or resources of the Town. The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds that the parts of the Significant Building to be retained are Preferably Preserved and shall not be demolished.**

**Discussion:**

George Jessop felt that the tower element adds some needed dimension, but Nancy Clark disagreed, feeling that it takes away a great deal of character of the house. Chair Young asked if any Historical Commissioners had concerns over the removal of one of the chimneys, and there was no objection to this or the redesign of the porch. Nancy Clark did have concerns with the numerous window changes, saying that the house is losing much of its distinctiveness. Mark Grenier stated that the previous homeowner replaced the windows in the 1990s and that, as Sarah Korjeff noted, most of the window changes were on the rear elevation.

Chair Young acknowledged 11 letters received and summarized that four of the letters were written in strong support of the applicant's work and six letters addressed issues that were not within the purview of the Historical Commission, while the final letter addressed the architectural changes proposed. She then read each name into the record. (Exhibits A-K)

**A Motion was duly made by Nancy Clark, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, to open Public Comment.  
So Voted Unanimously**

Richard Clark inquired about the new entrance doors on the west and north elevation and asked if there was to be a change in the driveway. Ted Wurzburg explained that driveways are not within the Historical Commission's purview, but he considered the west elevation an overall improvement from the previous design. George Jessop added that he felt that the new doors may satisfy an egress issue.

Farley Lewis asked for and received a copy of the comments provided by the Cape Cod Commission.

Elizabeth Mumford stated that she has reviewed the plans and inquired if the proposed alterations were within the current building code. Chair Young explained that this Committee does not consider this, as it is the responsibility of the building department to assure that the alterations meet the current building code.

**Hearing no further Public Comment, a Motion was made by Nancy Clark, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, to close Public Comment.  
So Voted Unanimously**

Nancy Clark stated that the window changes are of the most concern to her. Also, she pointed out that the Victorian trim on the north elevation is not drawn on the plans, but it is noted on the plan. Nancy Shoemaker said she would strongly suggest clapboards throughout, but especially on the east and south elevations, and Mr. Grenier indicated that he would be willing to change to clapboards.

George Jessop added that one of the photographs submitted with the application reveals a very distinctive header that he would like to see retained. He also suggested bringing up the tower fascia so that the roofs intersect at the same plane to give it the same line. Nancy Shoemaker concurred with the addition of the revised tower, and, again, Mr. Grenier agreed and felt he could incorporate these suggestions.

Nancy Shoemaker asked Historical Commissioners their opinion of the skylight, and George Jessop noted that there is a skylight on the opposite elevation and this one mimics the existing that.

**VOTE:**

**AYE: Clark, Fifield**

**NAY: Young, Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg**

**Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 62 Wachusett Avenue, Hyannis, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural or architectural heritage or resources of the Town. Partial Demolition is outlined in plans submitted by MG Design Build, Inc. dated January 25, 2016, and it is strongly recommended to replace the vinyl siding with clapboards and maintain the distinctive header on the rear of the building. For the tower element, the fascia should be brought up so that the roofs intersect at the same plane.**

**VOTE:**

**AYE: Young, Shoemaker, Jessop, Wurzburg**

**NAY: Clark, Fifield**

## **UPDATES/OTHER BUSINESS**

Nancy Shoemaker reminded that the 1717 Meetinghouse would be hosting the author of *The Finest Hour* on Friday at 7:00pm.

Nancy Shoemaker voiced concern about the relocation of the Luke's Love Playground directly behind the Old Selectmen's Building and suggested sending a letter outlining the Historical Commission's concerns. It was agreed that she would draft a letter to be discussed at the next meeting.

**With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, to adjourn the meeting at 5:43pm.  
So Voted Unanimously**

Respectfully submitted,  
Marylou Fair, Recording Secretary  
Edited by Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield

Exhibits A-K Eleven Letters received from the Public - File 287/081 Hearing Date 2/16/2016