

Town of Barnstable
Old King's Highway Historic District Committee
MINUTES
Wednesday, January 12, 2022, 6:30pm

To all persons deemed interested or affected by the Town of Barnstable's Old King's Highway Historic District Act under Section 9 of Chapter 470, Acts of 1973 as amended. You are hereby notified that a hearing was held by remote participation via Zoom Meetings on the following applications:

Paul Richard, Chair	Present
Bett McCarthy, Clerk	Present
George Jessop, AIA	Present
Ryan Coholan	Present
Lesley Wallace	Present
Jeffrey Goldstein, Alternate	Absent
Grayce Rogers, Administrative Assistant	Present

A quorum being met, Chair Richard called the hearing to order at 6:30 pm. The Chair explained the hearing and appeal process and invited the public to address the Committee and view the plans of interest when the application is called.

ROLL CALL

Chair Richard called the meeting to order at 6:30 pm and took roll call.

COMMITTEE ELECTIONS

Election for Committee Chair and Clerk

*Member McCarthy made a motion to nominate Paul Richard as Chair for a term of one year; 2022.
The motion was second by Member Jessop.*

So voted:

Aye- Jessop, McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan

Nay - 0

Abstain- Richard

*Member Wallace made a motion to nominate Bett McCarthy as Clerk for a term of one year; 2022.
The motion was seconded by Member Jessop*

So voted:

Aye- Jessop, Wallace, Coholan, Richard

Nay- 0

Abstain- McCarthy

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

Paulino, Marcus, 1802 Phinneys Lane, Barnstable, Map 297, Parcel 005/001, built c. 1986

Install a wooden fence.

The application was represented by Marcus Paulino.

Paulino explained that the fence will not start on the road. The start of the fence will start from a setback. There will be a 4 foot high fence for about 100 feet in length of the start of the fence and transition to 6 feet high for the rest of the perimeter.

There was no public comment.

Discussion:

Member Jessop discussed different types of style fences that could be considered.

Clerk McCarthy asked a clarifying question about if the stockade fence will be the style fence for the entire perimeter.

Member Wallace noted that the applicant has compromised with the Committee's suggestion from the previous meeting.

Member Coholan reviewed the previous meeting video and materials; he agreed with Wallace that this applicant has compromised.

Chair Richard noted that the amendments were appropriate.

Motion made by McCarthy to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as amended for Marcus Paulino at 1802 Phinneys Lane, Barnstable, Map 297, Parcel 005/001 which was built c. 1986 for the Installation a wooden fence with the amended four foot to six foot transition.

The motion was seconded by Wallace.

So voted:

Aye- Wallace, McCarthy, Richard

Nay - 0

Abstain- Coholan, Jessop

APPLICATIONS

Finnerty, Traci M. & Jonathan C. Anastos, 462 Main Street, West Barnstable, Map 133 Parcel 004/000, built c. 1967.

To install a cedar stockade fence which will include two transitions for split rail fence.

The application was represented by Traci Finnerty.

The proposed project is to install a 6 foot cedar stockade fence. The abutters on Meadow Lane are very close to the property. The transitions are intended to meet into split rail. The fencing may not be visible from 6A due to the orientation of the landscape on the parcel.

Discussion:

Member Jessop had the applicant clarify the gap which was noted that the gap represented the transition of the stockade and split rail fences.

Members McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan, and Chair Richard all concurred that the materials and style are appropriate.

Motion made by McCarthy to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted for Traci M. Finnerty & Jonathan C. Anastos at 462 Main Street, West Barnstable, Map 133 Parcel 004/000 which was built c. 1967.

The motion was seconded by Coholan.

So voted:

Aye- Jessop, McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan, Richard

Nay - 0

Abstain- 0

Munsell Jr, David P., 3075 Main Street, Barnstable, Map 279 Parcel 041/000.

To make alterations to windows, gutters, and doors on all four elevations.

The application was represented by David Munsell and Robert Yourell.

The proposed changes are being made to previously reviewed and approved additions. The corner board detailing will not be changed. The changes made will be eclectic changes to the architecture. There is some revival and federal design elements on the building. The windows on the frieze line on the west elevation will be removed for a more simple design. The representative thoroughly went over the window and door changes on each elevation.

There was no public comment.

Discussion:

Member Jessop noted that the current architectural elements are consecutive periods means that the additions must be consecutive in time as well. The representative noted that the aim of the proposed changes is to make it look as if they had always been there. The architecture on Route 6A represents multiple periods. No roof work is being conducted.

Clerk McCarthy and Member Wallace found the changes appropriate.

Member Coholan noted the removal of the window on the right side elevation. Yourell noted that off centered window are common in New England architecture and represents architectural character.

Member Jessop commented that the window on the rear that is being removed could leave the casing and fill the window in to appear to be a false window to give the rear elevation consistency in design.

Chair Richard noted that these are minor, appropriate changes.

Motion made by McCarthy to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted for David P. Munsell Jr. at 3075 Main Street, Barnstable, Map 279 Parcel 041/000 to make alterations to windows, gutters, and doors on all four elevations.

The motion was seconded by Wallace.

So voted:

Aye- Jessop, McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan, Richard

Nay - 0

Abstain- 0

Fowler, James & Deborah, 330 Sandy Neck Road, West Barnstable, Map 136 Parcel 014/001, built c. 1992.

To replace windows and doors.

The application was represented by James and Deborah Fowler.

Discussion:

Member Jessop clarified the orientation of the French door which will be near the rear.

Clerk McCarthy noted that the changes are not very visible and appropriate.

Member Wallace, Coholan, and Chair Richard Concurred with Clerk McCarthy.

Motion made by McCarthy to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as submitted for James & Deborah Fowler at 330 Sandy Neck Road, West Barnstable, Map 136 Parcel 014/001 which was built c. 1992 to replace windows and doors.

The motion was seconded by Wallace.

So voted:

Aye- Jessop, McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan, Richard

Nay - 0

Abstain- 0

McLaughlin, Kathleen, 104 Maushop Avenue, Barnstable, Map 299 Parcel 081/000, built c. 1976.

To replace roof, gutters, siding, doors, and windows, to construct a shed, and to paint the garage door, doors, and trim.

The applicant requested before the meeting for the application to be continued to the January 26, 2022 meeting to prepare their materials.

Motion made by McCarthy to continue the Certificate of Appropriateness for Kathleen McLaughlin at 104 Maushop Avenue, Barnstable, Map 299 Parcel 081/000 which was built c. 1976 to replace roof, gutters, siding, doors, and windows, to construct a shed, and to paint the garage door, doors, and trim.

The motion was seconded by Coholan.

So voted:

Aye- Jessop, McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan, Richard

Nay - 0

Abstain- 0

Diocese of Fall River, 4 Parker Road, West Barnstable, Map 197 Parcel 005/000, built c. 1920. Our Lady of Hope Catholic Church Built c. 1920, contributing structure in the Old King's Highway Historic District.

To remove existing slate roof and replace with new asphalt shingle roof.

Correspondence:

Letter – Town Councilor Kros Clark – Dated January 7, 2022

Letter – Marian Mathison Derosiers, PHD – Dated January 8, 2022

Electronic Mail – Frederick J Tirrell – Dated January 9, 2022

The application was represented by Bob Fakzaranc.

Fakzaranc noted that the existing slate roof has needed repair for about the last 30 years. It is proposed to replace the slate roof with a architectural asphalt shingle roof with a color matching that of the existing slate. He commented that he has worked at this property before. He suspects that under the existing slate roof that structural repairs will need to be made. Fakzaranc

Discussion:

Member Jessop commented that the key to a good tile roof is what is put under it. This job should require 60 pound felt, not 30 pound felt. The whole roof will have to come off. The asphalt replacement would seal against the wind and the weather. It would serve as the primary protection instead of the secondary. Plastic could be used for rafter tails, but only for what shows. The proposal is appropriate for the times.

Clerk McCarthy considers asphalt roofing that looks closer to the existing slate color would be endorsed.

Member Wallace voiced her concern for the safety issues of slate roofing deteriorating and falling off the roof. She noted that perhaps fake slate might be an alternative. Frakzaranc noted that fake slate does not seal and the shingles will move in the wind which eventually causes the shingles to break. Wallace is concerned that the proposed asphalt roof may not match the existing slate roof. Frakzaranc remarked that due to the increase in renovations this past year, roofing materials, including certain color asphalt shingles are not readily available.

Member Coholan noted that to rebuild this roof with slate would be a tremendous effort. He heard the representative voice their concerns for the need to repair the roof urgently. Coholan said perhaps the applicant might consider slate, but given that this work needs to occur sooner rather than later, believes that the proposed application is appropriate.

Chair Richard believed the application to be appropriate for modern times and modern materials available for this project as well as protecting the church from further water damage. He recommended after hearing public comment to continue the application for a month.

Public Comment:

Town Councilor Kris Clark of 398 Woodside Road, West Barnstable, is the current town of Barnstable councilor for precinct 11 which is where Our Lady of Hope resides. She has been a long time parishioner since 1983. She was the organist for 27 years. She has witnessed drips from the roof. She knows that the roof has needed maintenance and applauds Father Greg for addressing the serious structural concern for the integrity of historic building built in 1915, not 1920. The church was constructed by Catholic Portuguese immigrants. The design of the church is unique to Cape Cod and those Catholic immigrants handpicked West Barnstable bricks that they made and chose to place a slate roof on the church. This chapel was designated as a historic site in 1981 and was placed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1987. It was contributed to the Old King's Highway National Scenic Byway Status in February 2021. It is one of four in Massachusetts. The Catholic Portuguese chose to pick a slate roof. The church is a significant community and historical resource. Councilor Clark respectfully requested to postpone the application so that she can lead a campaign to raise funds to replace the slate roof. The Community Preservation Committee would hear an application for a funding request for the slate roof replacement. There are many people from the community that have ties to the church. Some of the slate roof tiles may be able to be reused.

Diane Bower, a parishioner of Our Lady of Hope, inquired about the slate roof replacement quote. The quote is \$120,050.00. The current proposal for the church with the asphalt shingles is \$37,000.00. She asked if Councilor Clark could make up the difference.

There was a motion made by Clerk McCarthy to continue the Certificate of Appropriateness to the February 9, 2022 meeting for Diocese of Fall River at 4 Parker Road, West Barnstable, Map 197 Parcel 005/000, built c. 1920. Our Lady of Hope Catholic Church Built c. 1920, contributing structure in the Old King's Highway Historic District to remove existing slate roof and replace with new asphalt shingle roof.

The motion was seconded by Member Wallace.

So voted:

Aye: Jessop, McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan, Richard

Nay:0

Abstain: 0

MINOR MODIFICATIONS

None

EXTENTIONS

None

MINUTES

A. November 17, 2021 Minutes

There was a motion made by Clerk McCarthy to approve the November 17, 2022 minutes.

The motion was seconded by Member Wallace.

So voted:

Aye: McCarthy, Wallace, Coholan

Nay:0

Abstain: Jessop, Richard

ADJOURNMENT

There was a motion to adjourn the meeting.

Respectfully Submitted,

Grayce Rogers

Administrative Assistant – Planning & Development

Exhibit A	Certificate of Appropriateness	File	297/005/001
Exhibit B	Certificate of Appropriateness	File	133/004/000
Exhibit C	Certificate of Appropriateness	File	279/041/000
Exhibit D	Certificate of Appropriateness	File	136/014/000
Exhibit E	Certificate of Appropriateness	File	299/081/000
Exhibit F	Certificate of Appropriateness	File	197/005/000